

Introduction

Bridget Heal

Recent decades have witnessed the fragmentation of Reformation studies. High-level research has tended to be confined within specific geographical, confessional or chronological boundaries. While authoritative surveys are still possible, few scholars would now be able to claim that research in their field is being driven forward by great works of synthesis. As a result, conferences, essay collections and even many undergraduate and graduate courses tend to focus on particular aspects of the long and complex process that constituted religious reform during the early modern period. By bringing together scholars working on a wide variety of topics, this volume aims to counteract this centrifugal trend and to provide a broad perspective on the impact of the European Reformation(s). The essays contained within it indicate the diverse directions in which Reformation scholarship is now moving, while reminding us of the need to understand particular developments within a broader European context.

The new research presented here from historians of politics, of the Church and of belief demonstrates that movements for religious reform left no sphere of early modern life untouched. While the main focus of this volume is on the Protestant Reformations, it is often impossible to understand the impact of these Protestant movements without considering the Catholic Church's responses to them. As the chapters by Luise Schorn-Schütte and Kevin Gould demonstrate, even in areas of Europe where the evangelical Reformation was ultimately unsuccessful, Protestantism had a tangible impact on Catholic religious and political culture. To view either Protestantism or Catholicism in isolation therefore inevitably detracts from our understanding of both.

The geographical scope of the contributions presented here is extensive, ranging from Scotland and England via France and Germany to Transylvania. This is a result of the editors' conviction that much of the most productive and exciting research in recent years has been, in part at least, the result of historians showing an increased awareness of the activities of scholars working on areas geographically remote from their own.¹ While

¹ See, for example, Margo Todd, *The Culture of Protestantism in Early Modern Scotland* (New Haven, CT and London, 2002), which makes extensive use of the techniques of historical anthropology pioneered by scholars such as Keith Thomas, Peter Burke and Bob Scribner.

regional differentiation will always be of paramount importance, in terms of the types of questions asked and the methodological approaches used, such intellectual exchanges can only deepen our understanding of early modern Europe.

The chronological span of the chapters in this volume is also considerable, starting in the 1520s and ending in the 1690s. Although specific political occurrences were, of course, key in instituting the Reformation in various parts of Europe, religious reform must be viewed as a process rather than an event. This process may have begun in the Holy Roman Empire during the 1520s, but in many parts of Europe its impact was felt only much later. Its political ramifications continued until well into the seventeenth century. Moreover, as work on both England and Germany has shown, the demands of providing a properly trained clergy to educate the populace meant that reform, in the sense of inculcating a true understanding of Protestant belief, took a very long time to achieve. For historians interested in questions of belief, it is therefore essential to look beyond the sixteenth century.

Princes

Part I of this volume considers the impact of the Reformation on political culture, investigating the extent to which Protestantism transformed traditional relationships between rulers and ruled. Three of the four chapters focus on the Holy Roman Empire, the heartland of the Reformation and, on account of its unique political structure, the site of some of the most interesting accommodations between governors and their subjects. One looks at southwest France, an area that witnessed some of the most extreme religious violence of the sixteenth century. The chapters demonstrate the extent to which, both at a macro and at a micro level, political life was transformed by the rise of the Reformation. For radical reformers, the traditional guarantors of political legitimacy were no longer sufficient: rulers had to uphold the true faith and protect the common weal if they were to retain their authority. Mainstream reformers – Luther, Calvin and Zwingli – accommodated themselves more successfully to existing secular authority, enabling their Reformations to survive. Yet even their more moderate demands brought about major changes in political life. In Germany, the authority of Lutheran princes within their own territories may have been strengthened, but the ideological unity of the Holy Roman Empire was compromised, and collapsed entirely with the onset of the Thirty Years' War. At a micro level, the Reformation might reinforce traditional social and political divisions, as it did in bi-confessional Augsburg, or it might provoke groups with divergent backgrounds and interests to present a united front, as it did in various cities in southwest France. Either way,

rulers and ruled were required to adjust to a new political landscape in which the ideology and realities of government, from political theory to patronage and administration, were complicated by competing religious loyalties.

Part I opens with a chapter by Tom Scott, which explains how evangelical thought enabled certain reformers to contemplate and to legitimate the violent overthrow of the prevailing social and political order. In their campaigns to transform religious life, the first generation of evangelical reformers had to decide under what circumstances secular authority could legitimately be opposed. For Luther, revolt by the common man could never be justified. But as the extent of opposition to the Gospel became clear, Luther, Zwingli and Calvin had to formulate carefully defined rights of resistance and to propose methods of deposing unjust and tyrannical rulers. The ideas that the Continental reformers developed in the heartlands of the Reformation should therefore, Scott argues, be considered on a continuous gradient from Luther through Calvin and Zwingli to the 'so-called radicals', proponents of an 'applied or politicized theology' that countenanced social revolution. Scott explores in detail the views of three such radical reformers, all of whom were involved in the Peasants' War of 1524–26: Balthasar Hubmaier, Christoph Schappeler and Hans Hergot. His chapter demonstrates that for each of these men, social revolution could be understood and legitimized only through the prism of radical Christianity. They advocated godly justice and Christian equality: if the Gospel was suppressed and if the common man was made to suffer under the yoke of temporal oppression, then social revolution might justifiably follow. It was, Scott argues, their vision of divine justice, brotherly love and the common weal that enabled sixteenth-century 'radicals' to contemplate the violent overthrow of the prevailing order.

The practical threat from such 'applied or politicized theology' was largely eliminated in the wake of the Peasants' War in 1524–25 and the subsequent collapse of the Münster 'Anabaptist Kingdom' in 1533–34, but the Reformation none the less had, as Scott Dixon demonstrates in Chapter 2, a profound and long-term impact on the political development of the Holy Roman Empire. With the 1555 Peace of Augsburg, Lutheran princes won the right to reform the Church within their territories, precipitating, Dixon argues, a thoroughgoing transformation in relations between rulers and ruled. Protestant princes engaged in a process of domestic reform, whereby their power was extended right down to the level of the parish through, for example, Church orders and visitations. Prompted by fear of Anabaptist preaching in particular, reformers such as Luther and Melchthon called on their princes to protect the true Church. Secular intervention in religious affairs increased, and Protestant princes came to be seen as guardians of the faith. As a result, they were able to draw on religion to an unprecedented

degree to consolidate and legitimize their rule. At an imperial level, however, the Reformation's impact was much less positive. Luther made effective use of nationalist discourse, and associated the empire with the corruption and tyranny of Rome. Moreover, by the mid-sixteenth century, Protestant princes had, Dixon writes, begun 'to define themselves *against* the Catholic emperor by drawing on the evangelical faith'. Since the time of the Schmalkaldic League, most Protestant territories had necessarily shared a general ideology of resistance. Thereafter, as Helen Watanabe-O'Kelly's work on the Wettin court in Dresden has shown, a distinctively Lutheran court culture emerged, which testified to its patrons' evangelical beliefs and affirmed their political claims through its art, literature and music.² Ultimately, of course, the empire survived as a system of political relations dealing with 'federal' issues such as taxation and defence. But its sacral legitimacy and its political integrity were, Dixon demonstrates, fatally compromised by the rise of confessionally determined blocs and divisions.

Despite these divisions it was sometimes possible, as Bernd Roeck shows in Chapter 3, for Protestants and Catholics to live side by side with a degree of equanimity. Germany's bi-confessional cities provide a unique opportunity for exploring the day-to-day realities of this *modus vivendi*. In a number of free and imperial cities within the empire, both Protestants and Catholics had the right to worship openly, their legal parity guaranteed by the Religious Peace of Augsburg.³ Roeck's chapter focuses on one of the most important and richly documented of these cities, Augsburg in Swabia. Here, he argues, a new confessional structure developed alongside the city's pre-existing social structure. The religious division between Catholic and Protestant to a large extent mirrored the long-standing social division between rich and poor. Augsburg's pauperized craftsmen were keen proponents of the Reformation. In the early stages of Augsburg's Reformation, with the preacher Johann Schilling, social and religious discontent merged: Schilling attacked the rich, and said, according to one chronicler, that all things should be shared. The wealthy Fugger family, on the other hand, were bastions of the old Church, and it was largely thanks to their influence, Roeck argues, that Catholicism survived in Augsburg. As the sixteenth century progressed, these two different social and cultural *milieux* became entrenched. In general, bloody escalations were avoided, but Augsburg's religious peace was always precarious, as the conflict that broke out over the Gregorian calendar reform in 1583–84 demonstrates.

² Helen Watanabe-O'Kelly, *Court Culture in Dresden: From Renaissance to Baroque* (Basingstoke, 2002).

³ See Paul Warmbrunn, *Zwei Konfessionen in einer Stadt. Das Zusammenleben von Katholiken und Protestanten in den paritätischen Reichsstädten Augsburg, Biberach, Ravensburg und Dinkelsbühl von 1548 bis 1648* (Wiesbaden, 1983).

The formation of separate confessional identities was accelerated by the Thirty Years' War, for, as Roeck points out, the co-existence that prevailed in Augsburg and in Germany's other bi-confessional cities was the product not of an ideology of toleration, but of prescribed pragmatism.

Elsewhere in Europe, it proved impossible to achieve even this degree of uneasy co-existence. France, for example, was wracked by four decades of religious warfare, despite the sporadic attempts of its rulers to promote conciliation between Catholics and Huguenots. The final chapter in Part I indicates that local studies of rulers and ruled may prove important in explaining France's patterns of religious warfare. Whereas in Augsburg the Reformation magnified a pre-existing social division, resulting in a lasting if uneasy balance of confessional power, in the cities that Kevin Gould studies in south-west France, the Protestant threat encouraged local Catholics of all classes to form a united front. Gould examines the struggles for control of three key urban sites: Bordeaux, Toulouse and Agen. In each case, despite some initial Protestant military success, Catholic defenders quickly regained and strengthened their positions, and by 1570 had established control over these cities to a degree that was unrivalled outside of Paris. In each city, Gould argues, the key to this success lay in a history of confessional conflict prior to 1562 that had encouraged local Catholics to form defensive organizations. The local *parlement*, communal authorities, clergy, urban bourgeoisie and lesser social groups as well as members of the nobility joined together to defend their faith, both by pressuring for anti-Protestant policy and by supplying troops to fight. In these cities, Gould demonstrates, the Reformation provoked a Catholic revival that pre-dated any attempts at religious renewal inspired by Trent and its agents.

Clergy

Part II considers the Church and its personnel, another sphere of early modern life that was entirely transformed by the rise of the Reformation. In Protestant territories, the clerical estate, with its traditional privileges and immunities, disappeared, and was replaced by body of married clergymen who were, as Luise Schorn-Schütte points out, 'gradually integrated into the daily world of the faithful'.⁴ Preaching and pastoral work, rather than, as in the medieval Church, the administration of the sacraments, were their most important duties. Recent research has emphasized the importance of this changing 'clerical paradigm', and has traced the evangelical Churches' prolonged struggle to produce men capable of fulfilling it. Until well into the early decades of the seventeenth century, Scott Dixon and Luise Schorn-Schütte suggest, 'the general level of learning among Protestant pastors

⁴ See page 121.

consistently remained much lower than has previously been assumed', especially in the countryside.⁵ Gradually, however, through the provision of schools and universities offering a proper education in theology as well as practical ministerial training, the level of education among the Protestant clergy improved and they became more conscious of their calling and of the duties that their office entailed.

There has been a tendency to emphasize the distinctive nature of the Protestant pastorate, and to see its members as different from the traditional clergy because of their social and economic circumstances, their educational backgrounds, their relationships with the authorities and with local parishioners, and their sense of professional self-awareness. However, Luise Schorn-Schütte argues in Chapter 5 that by the seventeenth century, the evangelical ideal of a well trained, preaching pastor had shaped not only the Protestant but also the Catholic clerical body. The Protestant 'clerical paradigm' had a profound impact on the Catholic Church. The foundation of the Jesuit Order, of other reform orders and of the *Collegium Germanicum* in Rome was, Schorn-Schütte suggests, 'the Catholic response to the redefinition of clerical office within the Protestant church'.⁶ Through these organizations, the Tridentine reform movement produced priests who, unlike the medieval pastoral clergy, were no longer concerned exclusively with assisting their congregations in the quest for salvation through the administration of the sacraments and an emphasis on good works, but were also leaders of parishes and proclaimers of God's word. In their socio-economic backgrounds, in their levels of education, in their material circumstances, and even, in many cases, in their relations with their parishioners, these men were often very like their Protestant counterparts.

Of course, crucial differences remained: while Catholic clerical office retained its sacral character, the ideal Protestant pastor was an exemplary family man. Moreover, he was engaged with moral discipline and with worldly affairs to a greater extent than his Catholic equivalent. Protestant pastors were not only preachers; they were also shepherds of souls, and were charged with watching over their parishioners' behaviour and ensuring their obedience to God's commands. While the exercise of excessive zeal in this sphere could provoke resentment, Christopher Haigh suggests in Chapter 6 that in England, one of the key expectations of a minister was that he should 'play a part in parish discipline, and seek to sustain peace and order among his people'.⁷ Margo Todd has suggested that in Scotland, the services the Kirk could offer as a result of local sessions – in particular

⁵ C. Scott Dixon and Luise Schorn-Schütte (eds), *The Protestant Clergy of Early Modern Europe* (Basingstoke, 2003), pp. 3, 23.

⁶ See page 106.

⁷ See page 126.

discipline in such matters as domestic violence, arbitration of quarrels and administration of poor relief – help explain parishioners' acquiescence to the Calvinist system.⁸ In England, Haigh argues, these services were equally significant, but their provision has been obscured by the nature of the written records. England may not have had local Kirk sessions, but court act books and deposition books offer plenty of evidence of clergy and churchwardens providing informal justice, arbitration and conciliation. Ecclesiastical discipline was imposed at a local level, with pastors using communion and the sanction of exclusion to promote the resolution of disputes and to enforce proper behaviour. Indeed, even once cases reached court, local ministers often remained engaged and interceded on behalf of parishioners. Haigh's archival evidence demonstrates that in England, as in Scotland, part of a pastor's duty was to restore communal harmony when it was threatened, and that the enforcement of discipline could be 'local, personalized, conciliatory and flexible'.⁹

Even in Lutheran Transylvania, Christine Peters argues in Chapter 7, local context was key in shaping pastors' relations with their congregations and in determining the nature of the emergent Protestant Church. Every evangelical Church had to make decisions about ritual and discipline: what should the new Church look like, and how should its ministers enforce proper behaviour? The lenient decisions the Saxon reformers took with regard to ritual seem at odds with their relatively harsh prescriptions concerning disciplinary matters such as marriage, the observance of the Sabbath and filial obedience. The 1547 *Reformation ecclesiarum saxonicarum* accommodated regional preferences in terms of ritual and imagery; indeed, some Saxon Lutheran Churches looked sufficiently traditional to deceive visitors into thinking that they were still Catholic. In matters of discipline, however, the Saxon Church was much more rigorous than other Lutheran Churches. Peters suggests that this apparent paradox can be resolved by paying proper attention to 'the logic of pre-Reformation religious and social instruction'.¹⁰ Using the example of surviving late fifteenth-century wall paintings from the church at Honigberg near Kronstadt, she demonstrates that the region's traditional religious and social concerns, in particular its Christocentric Marian piety and its notion of individual Christian vocation, played a decisive role in determining the preoccupations of the evangelical Church that emerged there during the sixteenth century.

While Haigh's and Peters' chapters demonstrate the importance of local context in understanding the Reformation's impact on the Church and its personnel, the final chapter in Part II returns us to the realm of high

⁸ Todd, *The Culture of Protestantism in Early Modern Scotland*, ch. 5 and 6.

⁹ See page 140.

¹⁰ See page 154.

politics. As the Reformation became established, Church and state were bound more closely together. The self-governing hierarchy of the Catholic Church disappeared, and clergy found themselves dependent upon the state. This relationship was by no means always an easy one, as Michael Graham demonstrates in Chapter 8. Graham considers the Scottish clergy's engagement with the political sphere, drawing examples from the 1590s and 1690s, critical phases during which the clergy sought to test the extent of their influence by injecting religious discourse into the political arena. During the 1590s, James VI's godly ministers were concerned primarily with the threat of diabolism and with the king's religious backsliding (in particular with his dealings with Catholics at court). After the events of the revolutionary period of 1637–51 and of the Williamite revolution of 1688–89, the threats to the Kirk were of a different nature: primarily the religious laxity associated with Episcopalianism and growing tendency towards scepticism. There was an ongoing need for ministers to persuade magistrates to uphold the covenanted vision of Scottish society. The comparison between these two periods allows Graham to explore the nature of the clergy's relationship with political authority, and to illustrate the limits to the kings' toleration of the notion of 'Presbyterian political divinity' that, ministers felt, gave them the right to influence the policies of the kingdom.

People

Part III addresses issues of knowledge and belief. In his 1993 article 'The Reformation, Popular Magic and the "Disenchantment of the World"', Bob Scribner called for scholars to 'construct a new understanding of the Reformation ... which takes account of those dissonant elements which falsify the paradigm that has been hitherto accepted, and then to write a new history of Protestantism which includes the religious experience and practice of ordinary believers, with all of their contradictions and misunderstandings'.¹¹ The first two chapters in this part demonstrate the extent to which Reformation historians have responded to this call. Margo Todd and Alexandra Walsham explore the persistence of traditional beliefs in Protestant societies. These beliefs were sometimes, as in the case of Todd's Scottish fairies, at odds with the official teaching of the Church, but were sometimes, as in the case of Walsham's holy wells, successfully assimilated into Protestant piety. The second two chapters, which examine the elite intellectual world of natural philosophy and astronomy and the book trade, remind us that in our determination to recover the religious experiences of all social groups, we must avoid bifurcating popular and

¹¹ R.W. Scribner, 'The Reformation, Popular Magic and the "Disenchantment of the World"', *Journal of Interdisciplinary History*, 23/3 (1993): 494.

elite belief. For all sixteenth-century people, religion was of paramount importance: the world was created and regulated by God, and both peasant and scholar lived with ‘a cosmology still ordered principally by divinity rather than human reason’ (Todd).¹² This was a world where natural philosophical investigations such as astronomy could be viewed as a branch of theology, and where printing and the book market developed, in part at least, according to the requirements of religious change.

In her 2002 study *The Culture of Protestantism in Early Modern Scotland*, Margo Todd analysed what she described as Scotland’s ‘cultural revolution’, the process by which the country’s late medieval religious cult, with its ‘sensual and ceremonial spirituality’, was replaced by Calvinist orthodoxy. She pointed out, however, that despite the imposition of uniform Calvinist belief and practice and the Kirk’s vociferous condemnation of what it described as ‘popish superstition’, early modern Scots remained convinced that their world was populated by wizards and witches, fairies and demons, and angels and ghosts.¹³ In Chapter 9, Todd focuses on one aspect of this surviving pre-Christian belief system: fairy belief. According to the accounts given by those who had met them, fairies lived under hills and appeared beside springs and streams; they were exotic in appearance, and behaved in a festive manner. They were capricious: they gave good gifts, but could also do harm. Stories concerning them therefore contradicted the Kirk’s teaching on the rewarding of good and punishing of evil, yet belief in fairies was by no means confined to the level of the uneducated populace: educated and ignorant, rich and poor spoke of them and sought their aid. Moreover, for all its strident rhetoric, the Kirk rarely took decisive action against those who claimed to have received special powers of healing or second sight from the fairies. Such healers often operated for many years before some mishap led to their condemnation by their elders. Why did these beliefs, so much at odds with the providential view of the universe promulgated by Christian orthodoxy, persist for so long? Most importantly, Todd suggests, because fairies were an important part of the cosmology of a people always vulnerable to the arbitrary forces of nature. They were a manifestation of a ‘nature religion’, which reflected the powerful sense of place that characterized the lives of early modern communities and the obvious power that resided in natural phenomena such as rivers and storms. It was possible, Todd demonstrates, for this ancient cosmology to co-exist with Calvinist orthodoxy, which reminds us, as Scribner’s work did, of the need to understand the early modern world in its own terms, contradictions and all.

¹² Todd, *The Culture of Protestantism in Early Modern Scotland*, p. 318.

¹³ *Ibid.*, Introduction and pp. 317, 355–7. For a recent discussion of the role of angels in Protestant piety, see Peter Marshall and Alexandra Walsham (eds), *Angels in the Early Modern World* (Cambridge, 2006).

The sense of place and the close relationship to the natural world that facilitated belief in fairies in seventeenth-century Scotland found another manifestation in pre-Reformation England, where sacred springs and wells attracted pilgrims seeking miraculous cures. These springs and wells, many of which had been connected since pre-Christian times with healing, were attacked by the Protestant reformers as part of their assault on idolatry and superstition. From the 1570s onwards, however, some of these sites were revived and promoted on account of their therapeutic powers by members of the medical establishment. Confirmation of the mineral content of the waters of these 'approved' springs distanced them from their superstitious past, but as Walsham points out in Chapter 10, this did not herald the triumph of 'scientific' rationalism. In fact, 'contemporary perception of such sites remained firmly locked within a framework of religious assumptions'.¹⁴ Healing baths and springs were understood by the doctors who promoted them as gifts from God, and patients were encouraged to engage in prayer and repentance before and during their visits. The cures that occurred were not described in purely medical terms; indeed, on occasion they were even referred to as miracles. The quest for a proper understanding of the workings of nature was not, Walsham demonstrates, incompatible with a continued belief in the divine origins of healing. This belief survived into the post-Reformation era, not, as in the case of fairy belief, as part of a rival cosmology. Rather, English Protestant piety proved able to integrate holy wells and springs into its reformed, providential understanding of the universe. In this, it was not unique, as recent investigation into the role of holy springs in post-Reformation Denmark has shown.¹⁵

Adam Mosley's chapter on the reformation of astronomy also demonstrates that natural philosophical enquiries into the created world and a belief in divine providence often sat comfortably side-by-side together. The early modern period proved crucial in the history of astronomy: it witnessed the emergence of a new understanding of the cosmos, which began with Copernicus and culminated in Newton and the birth of modern 'classical' physics. Mosley considers the extent to which the emergence of this 'new astronomy' was shaped by the religious debates of the sixteenth century, thereby placing the narrative of the Copernican breakthrough firmly within the context of the Protestant Reformation. Organized religion should not, as recent studies have demonstrated, be seen as an obstacle to new undertakings and investigations in natural philosophy. On the contrary, Moseley argues that religious belief was in

¹⁴ See page 218.

¹⁵ Jens C.V. Johansen, 'Holy Springs and Protestantism in Early Modern Denmark: A Medical rationale for a Religious Practice', *Medical History*, 41/1 (1997): 59–69.

fact a motivating factor in the study of the created world. In Wittenberg, for example, Philip Melanchthon supported the study of astronomy and cosmology through his reforms of the university's educational curriculum. Melanchthon and his circle saw a religious and philosophical role for the study of the heavens: the movements of the stars and planets provided, they argued, evidence of God's providential ordering of creation, and moreover, God communicated with man through signs and portents in heaven. Natural philosophical study therefore complemented the study of the Bible, and astronomy could be regarded, as it was, for example, by Johannes Kepler, as a theological endeavour, a way of understanding divine providence. 'God is worshipped by my work,' Kepler wrote, 'even in astronomy'.¹⁶ The work of Tycho Brahe was also, Moseley argues, stimulated by Melanchthon's legacy. As both Walsham's and Moseley's chapters demonstrate, if the history of natural philosophy is separated from the history of religion, our understanding of the former will remain at best incomplete.

The last chapter in this volume turns to printing and the book trade, another field closely bound up with the Reformation. As Andrew Pettegree argued in his *Reformation and the Culture of Persuasion*, 'there can be little doubt that the book did much to shape the Reformation; it must also be acknowledged that the Reformation did much to reshape the book'.¹⁷ The Reformation emerged, Pettegree points out, when printing was still a developing industry, and its impact on the nascent book trade was huge. Wittenberg and Geneva, for example, became major centres of printing thanks entirely to Luther and Calvin. In Chapter 12 of this volume, Pettegree explores the international book market, focusing in particular on the Frankfurt Book Fair, which was so fundamental to its functioning. Surviving catalogues of books offered for sale at the Frankfurt fair allow us to trace the impact of religious and political changes on the production and sale of books. Despite Frankfurt's Protestant status, Pettegree notes, the fair saw a lively trade in Catholic as well as Protestant titles. During the second half of the sixteenth century, these catalogues reveal that in addition to the usual Latin and German titles, there were a significant number of French books for sale at the Frankfurt fair. After 1570, in particular, 'turbulent contemporary politics impact increasingly on the works offered for sale'.¹⁸ Members of the French Huguenot movement forced to travel abroad, French nationals settled in Germany and interested foreign observers were able to purchase vernacular works on theology, history and contemporary politics to provide them with news and solace, and to guide them through

¹⁶ See page 239.

¹⁷ Andrew Pettegree, *Reformation and the Culture of Persuasion* (New York, 2005), p. 128.

¹⁸ See page 257.

the difficult political choices facing France's Protestants during the Wars of Religion. During the 1590s, the character of the French books for sale at Frankfurt changed, and as peace appeared imminent, they disappeared entirely from the catalogues. Pettegree's chapter returns us, at the end of the volume, to the world of high politics, showing how the printing and book industry, one of the greatest innovations of the early modern period, responded to Europe's volatile political and religious history.

The chapters gathered together in the final part of this book demonstrate beyond doubt that there is no place left in Reformation studies for Max Weber's narrative that sees Protestantism as a crucial step in the 'disenchantment of world' and in the teleological triumph of rationalism over 'superstition'.¹⁹ New medical theories and Copernicus' heliocentric universe may have been crucial developments in the so-called 'Scientific Revolution'; printing may be, as the Scottish philosopher Thomas Carlyle suggested, one of the 'three great elements of modern civilization' (the other two being gunpowder and Protestantism itself).²⁰ But we must not misinterpret these phenomena as moves towards secularization and modernization. In each, religion remained pre-eminent: for Protestants, the natural world, from healing spas to stars, could be read as a manifestation of divine providence, and the emergence of the printing industry was dictated to a large extent by the demands of religious reform. Moreover, as Margo Todd shows in Chapter 9, the Reformation certainly did not eliminate the 'magic' from everyday life. Seventeenth-century Scottish fairy belief draws our attention to the persistence of multiple and mutually contradictory cosmologies. It reminds us that in explaining the 'success' of the Reformation – the gradual transition to Protestant belief – we must pay proper attention to continuity with the past and to the reformers' willingness to accommodate or adapt traditional modes of behaviour and ways of thought.

¹⁹ See, for example, R.W. Scribner, 'Reformation and Desacralisation: From Sacramental World to Moralised Universe', in R. Po-Chia Hsia and R. Scribner (eds), *Problems in the Historical Anthropology of Early Modern Europe* (Wiesbaden, 1997).

²⁰ Thomas Carlyle, 'The State of German Literature', in *The Works of Thomas Carlyle*, vol. 26, *Critical and Miscellaneous Essays I* (London, 1899), p. 28.